



Women and War: Exposing Palestinian Women Resistance Through Literary Work

Shinta Fitria Utami¹, Yulfira Riza², Taufik Amin Nur Wijaya³

¹ Universitas Islam Negeri (UIN) Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin Jambi Indonesia

² Universitas Islam Negeri Imam Bonjol Padang Indonesia

³ University of Delhi India

shintafitriaautami@uinjambi.ac.id

Abstract:

Warfare is often associated with masculinity, leading to the absence of women's roles during times of war. This phenomenon also occurs in the Palestinian conflict, where narratives related to the resistance of Palestinian women are frequently overlooked. As a direct reflection of life, literary works capture the reality of Palestinian women's resistance. Therefore, this research aims to expose the resistance of Palestinian women as reflected in an Arabic novel titled *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah* by Raḍwā 'Āṣūr. This study is a library research with a descriptive analytical approach. It utilizes Hélène Cixous's ideas regarding the binary opposition of patriarchy. The research data is derived from words, phrases, and sentences in the novel *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah* that narrate the resistance of Palestinian women. Data collection begins with intensive reading techniques to ensure a comprehensive understanding. Subsequently, the data is categorized according to the topics of discussion. The data analysis process involves contextual investigation to strengthen primary data through supporting literatures and scholarly articles. The research findings indicate that Palestinian women indeed live under the shadow of patriarchal culture. However, they also actively participate in resistance against Israeli occupation. Their resistance involves non-violent actions such as aiding war accommodations, writing, and engaging in protests. Additionally, they resist through military and political means.

Abstract

Keywords: Palestinian women; war; resistance; Arabic novel; literature

Keywords

INTRODUCTION

On October 7, 2023, Hamas launched a sudden attack on Israel's defenses from the Gaza Strip by land, sea, and air. The attack happened on a Jewish holiday, immediately following the fifty-year commemoration of the unexpectedness Egyptian-Syrian attacks that triggered the Yom Kippur War (Zanotti & Sharp, 2023). Public attention swiftly turned to various news reports, particularly those concerning Hamas. Hamas or *Harākah al-Muqāwamah al-Islamiyyah* is a political movement that gained prominence during the first *Intifada* in 1987 (Basyuni, 2015). It can be concluded that Hamas represents the Palestinian community's rebellion against Israeli occupation after years of dissatisfaction with the resistance efforts of the Palestinian Liberation Organization and Fatah (Cowper-Coles, 2022).

With the advancements in technology over the past few years, social media has emerged as a crucial communication tool. Indirectly, social media influences the present conflict in Palestine. It has given rise to citizen journalists who stand at the forefront (Zeitsoff, 2018). It also serves as an alternative channel for Palestinians to present their perspectives and provide information immediately (Amer, 2023). Therefore, the global community can easily access images or videos displayed through various social media platforms, including narratives related to Hamas.

Despite the Western media framing, Hamas is perceived as the guardian of Gaza from Israeli attacks. In the TikTok account @Aj+, for instance, Hamas fighters are portrayed as brave men dressed in military uniforms, *kafiyeh*, and armed with weapons. They relentlessly assault Israel's defenses without fear for the sake of Palestinian freedom. From this phenomenon, their physical appearance and valor in war are often associated with masculinity. In this regard, war is solely centered on the activities of men who descend into the battlefield and confront the enemies.

According to Cockburn's article *War and Security, Women and Gender: an Overview of the Issues*, women in some countries have the opportunity to join the military. However, militarism demands training that is inherently masculine. Therefore, women are often treated differently in military training (Cockburn, 2014). This also leads to the absence of women from matters related to war. Women are depicted as second-class citizens in the struggle for independence. It can be seen from historical records where the majority of national heroes are men. It proves that women are already marginalized even in discourse (Handayani, 2023).

The alienation of women is also witnessed in the context of Palestine. Women are often positioned as victims when warfare ensues. Women living in conflict zones, such as the Gaza Strip, frequently experience severe trauma as a result of loss and violence (Veronese et al., 2019). In contrast, Palestinian women have actively participated in the struggle for Palestinian independence. However, their presence often lacks significant attention from the global community (Jad, 2018). In alignment with it, Palestinian women face discriminatory treatment from the Israeli army. The discrimination leads to movements of Palestinian women's resistance to reclaim their rights (Lasut et al., 2022). It is regrettable that these movements often disappear from historical narratives, resulting in women being consistently portrayed as weak and powerless individuals.

Literature, as a symbolic communication, emerges to fill the void in narratives concerning the resistance movements of Palestinian women. One such example is the

Arabic novel titled *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah* by Raḍwā ‘Āṣūr. The novel tells the story of Ruqayyah and her family, who live in the village of Tantura. In 1948, the village was seized by Israel. Some of the villagers were massacred, while others were forcibly expelled from their houses. She bears witness to various cruel events inflicted upon Palestinians around her. Despite *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah* capturing the plight of Palestinian refugees, the novel also depicts the struggle of Palestinian women to resist Israeli occupation in their own way.

This novel stands as one of Raḍwā ‘Āṣūr's masterpieces. Therefore, it possesses its own allure for analysis through various literary approaches. In previous research, this novel was examined using an ecocritical approach. The findings indicated that the natural beauty of the village of Tantura plays a central role in the novel. It is no longer merely a supplementary element to the plot (Bustam, 2014). The novel records the history of the Nakba events of 1948, which the Israeli government has sought to erase (El-Mansi, 2021). It also portrays the transmission of traumatic memories of the main character, both familial and affiliative (Utami, 2022). Additionally, the novel serves as a resistance against the cultural appropriation of Palestine by Israel. It is evident in the presence of seven cultural aspects that affirm Palestinian identity as a nation (Utami, 2023).

The following studies focus on women's issues in the novel. The first study reveals that the novel uncovers instances of rape of Palestinian women that have been concealed by the Israeli government (Nashef, 2021). Furthermore, the novel exposes a different genocide event compared to the mainstream history widely circulated within society. It also highlights the sexist oppression experienced by the main character and her ability to rise above all that befalls her (Halizza et al., 2022).

Although there have been numerous studies concerning women in the novel *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah*, the resistance of Palestinian women against Israeli occupation has not been thoroughly explored. This research aims to unveil the portrait of Palestinian women's resistance movements that have been omitted from the narrative due to the dominance of patriarchal culture. Therefore, this study adopts the ideas of Hélène Cixous, specifically the theory of patriarchal binary. Cixous argues that, within the patriarchal perspective, men and women are binary distinguished. There will always be two things separated into two groups, akin to two poles. This binary opposition creates differences between them in the construct of society (Herlina et al., 2022). Women are associated with femininity and the traits that follow, such as nurturing, gentleness, sensitivity, and so forth, while men are associated with masculinity and its contrasting traits.

In addition, due to the binary patriarchy, women live in a world already constructed by the patriarchal system. They are marginalized and labeled with negative traits. In her essay *the Laugh of the Medusa*, Cixous emphasizes that women must free themselves from the confines of patriarchy and resist the construction of masculinity. Women must reveal their hidden abilities. She asserts that women must write about themselves, women must write about women, and women must encourage other women to write (Cixous, 1976). Through writing, women can position themselves as significant individuals. This aligns with the portrayal of Palestinian women's resistance against Israeli occupation in the novel *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah* which was also written by a woman.

METHOD

This study in a library research utilizing qualitative analytical approach. This method is a research procedure that produces descriptive data in the form of written or spoken behavioral information. Human observation is central to a particular tradition in the social sciences and humanities (Semi, 2021). In the context of interpretation, the research data presented are words, phrases, and sentences from the text (Ahmadi, 2019). Therefore, the research data comprise words, phrases, and sentences within the text of the novel *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah* published by Dar asy-Syuruq pada tahun 2010.

The data collection process begins with intensive reading techniques to generate in-depth understanding. Subsequently, the data are categorized according to the discussion topics. The data analysis process involves contextual investigation to reinforce primary data through supporting references and scholarly articles.

FINDINGS & DISCUSSION

In general, women are often considered second-class citizens in societal structures. They are frequently viewed merely as fulfilling the biological needs of men (Habibullah & Rahmah, 2023). Women are confined to the domestic sphere, leading to their marginalization. This phenomenon is also evident in Arab societies. An intriguing aspect is that Arab women began to feel alienated with the division of tasks between men and women. Since then, they have lost their independence and positive identities (El Saadawi, 2015).

Over time, Arab women have begun to emerge from the domestic sphere. One example is the involvement of Palestinian women in the first Intifada movement in 1988. Unlike many discussions focusing on women's suffering, scholars focusing on the *Intifada* events demonstrate women's experiences as agents of change facing various challenges in gender relations within Palestinian society (Jamal, 2020). However, the image of Arab women as resilient, courageous, strong, and independent is often overlooked due to the binary patriarchal construction.

Literature is a reflection of life. The novel *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah* portrays the lives of Palestinian women from two perspectives. They are indeed constrained under the power of patriarchal culture. However, on the other hand, the novel also narrates how Palestinian women strive to resist Israeli occupation.

Palestinian Women Under Patriarchal Power in *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah*

The issue of patriarchal power continues until the present day. Patriarchy causes injustice, particularly for women (Mawaddah et al., 2021). Through the novel, Raḍwā 'Āṣūr acknowledges the existence of patriarchal power, as evidenced by the following quotation:

هل أرادني أمين أم غصبه أبوه على الزواج مني لأنني ابنة عمه وابنة خالته
ويتيمة الأب والأخوين؟ وما الذي يريده وهو الطبيب الشاب من بنت لم
تتم دراستها الثانوية؟

Hal Arādanī Amīn am ghaṣabahu abūhu 'alā al-zuwāji minnī liannanī ibnah 'ammihi wa ibnah khālatihi wa yaṭimah al-abī wa al-akhwayni? Wa ma alladhi yurīduhu wa huwa al-ṭabīb al-shāb min bintin lam tatim dirāsatahā al-thanawīyyah? ('Āsyūr, 2010).



Does Amin desire me, or is it his father forcing him to marry me because I am the daughter of his uncle, the daughter of his aunt, or an orphan without a father and two brothers? What does a young doctor want from a girl who hasn't completed her secondary education?

The quote reflects Ruqayyah's inner thoughts. She feels unworthy spending time with Amin because of their social status differences. Amin is portrayed as a brilliant young doctor, superior to a woman who has not completed her education and has no male relatives. The quote implies the existence of binary opposition. Men are considered superior, whereas women are regarded as inferior.

Men's existence is valued more than women's. Unconsciously, women feel insecure as 'women'. They become submerged in patriarchal power and are confined by the labels attached to them. This is evident in the following quote:

قامت أمي مهرولة. فتبعته، قصدت دار المختار وطلبت مني أن أدخل
المضافة وأنا أنادي أبي. جاء.
خير يا أم صادق؟
سمعت بما حدث في حيفا؟
سمعت
ألن تذهب لترى ولدك؟!
ربنا يحميها، لو كان أي منهما أصيب لجاءنا الخبر من مائة جهة. اطمئني،
ما حدث في مصافة النفط، وهي بعيدة عن مسكنهما وعن المدرسة
والبنك.
ولكن الولدين
الولدان إن شاء الله بخير وسيأتيان في نهاية الأسبوع، وإن لم يتمكن بسبب
الظروف فسيأتيان في الأسبوع القادم

Qāmat ummī mahrūlah. Fataba'tuhā, qaṣadat dāra al-mukhtār wa ṭalabat minnī an adkhula al-maḍāfah wa anā unādī abī. Jā'a.

Khair yā ummā Ṣādiq?

Sami'ta bimā ḥadatha fī Hayfā

Sami'tu

Alan tadhhab litarā waladayka?!

Rabbunā yaḥmīhimā, law kāna ayyu minhumā uṣība lajā'anā al-khabaru min mī'ati jihḥatin. Iṭma'innī, mā ḥadatha fī maṣāfah al-naftī, wa hiya ba'īdah 'an maskanihimā wa 'an al-madrasati wa al-bank

Wa lakinna al-waladayni

Al-Waladāni in syā'a Allahu bikhayrin wa saya'tiyāni fī nihāyati al-usbū'i, wa in lam yatamakan bisababi al-ẓurūf fasaya'tiyāni fī al-usbū'i al-qādimi ('Āsyūr, 2010)

My mother got up and ran. I followed her as she headed towards the village chief's house and asked me to enter the meeting room and call my father. He came.

What's wrong, Shadiq's mother?

Have you heard what happened in Haifa?

I heard it

Aren't you going to go to see your two sons?
 Our God is watching over both of them. If either of them is affected by calamity, we will hear about it from a hundred directions. Relax, what happened at the oil refinery is far from where they both reside, school, and bank.
 But the two sons...
Insha Allah, they are fine, and they will come home at the end of the week. If it's not possible due to circumstances, they will come next week.

The quote above depicts a conversation between Ruqayyah's parent. Her mother feels anxious and fearful during a clash between Arab and Jewish workers in Haifa. She worries about the condition of her two sons who are there. This contrasts with the nature of her father, who is depicted as more composed in responding to the news. However, he also doesn't yet know the status of his two sons. From the quote, it can be observed that there is a binary opposition within patriarchal norms. Men are portrayed as brave and calm, while women are depicted as the opposite, fearful and impulsive. The attribute of bravery is constructed as something positive, while fearfulness is constructed inversely.

The public and domestic spheres are also highlighted by Raḍwā 'Āṣūr through the novel *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah*. Women and men are divided into spheres that have been constructed by the power of patriarchal cultural norms, as depicted in the following quote:

مضافة البلد في بيت المختار، يجمع فيها الرجال للحديث والسمر وللمناقشة
 المستجد من الأمور وأحيانا لحال النزاعات... النساء لا يدخلن المضافة فلا
 يصلهن من الأخبار إلا ما يتفضل الرجال بنقله لهن. فيتناقلنه بعد ذلك
 فيما بينهم.

Maḍāfah al-baladi fī bayti al-mukhtār, yajma'u fihā al-rijālu lil ḥadīthi wa al-samari wa al-munāqashah al-mustajiddi min al-umūri wa aḥyānan liḥālī an-nizā'āt... al-Nisāu lā yadkhulna al-maḍāfati falā yaṣiluhunna min al-akhbāri illā mā yatafaḍḍalu al-rijālu binaqlihi lahunna. Fayatanāqalnahū ba'da dhālika fimā baynahum ('Āsyūr, 2010).

The meeting room at the village chief's house. Men gather inside it to converse, socialize, and discuss new matters, sometimes to resolve disputes... Women do not enter that meeting room, so they do not receive any news except what is conveyed by the men happily. They then spread it among themselves.

In Palestinian culture, the meeting hall, called maḍāfah, is a part of the social organization among the villagers (Utami, 2023). This place serves as a public facility intended for deliberation among village residents. However, the quote indicates that women do not have the opportunity to voice their opinions in the public sphere. They only await news given when the men deem it appropriate. They discuss this news among themselves without their opinions being heard by the general public. This phenomenon is in stark contrast to men, who are freer to express themselves in the public realm, affirming their greater authority and ability to decide on all matters.

Cixous observes the sexist tendency correlated with language and thought, as well as the dependence on dualism (Taheri et al., 2020). This dualism will always exist in human life, especially in the difference between women and men. This is evident in the following quote:

في شاتيلّا تعلمت أن عالم النساء أرحم من عالم الرجال. الرجال منخرطون
في الفصائل، لكل فصيل مكتبه ومنطقته وشبابه المسلح. يختلفون
فيستبكون كالديك. يا إلهي ديك مسلحة! وديك في البيت أيضا. يعودون
لنساءهم يأمرّون وينهون. والمرأة غارقة في مهام يومها

Fī Shātīlā ta'alamtu anna 'ālama al-nisāi arḥam min 'ālamī al-rijālī. al-Rijālū munkhariṭūn fī al-faṣā'ili, likulli faṣīlin maktabuhu wa minṭaqatuhu wa syabābuhu al-musallaḥu. Yakhtaliḥūna fayastabikūna ka al-dīki. Yā ilāhī dīkun musallaḥah! Wa dīkun fī al-bayti aiḍan. Ya'ūdūna linisāihim ya'murūna wa yanhawna. Wal al-mar'atu ghāriqah fī mahāmi yawmihā ('Āsyūr, 2010).

In Shatila, I learned that the world of women is more compassionate than the world of men. Men are divided into factions. Each faction has its own office, territory, and weapons. They quarrel and fight like roosters. Oh God, armed roosters! And roosters at home too. They come home, order, and forbid. Meanwhile, women are submerged in their daily routine.

From the quote, it can be inferred that compassion is a trait attributed to women, while firmness and toughness are attributed to men. In reality, traits such as compassion, firmness, and toughness naturally develop in both men and women. However, patriarchal culture divides these natural traits and assigns them to specific genders, thereby creating constructed differences perpetuated by society.

This dichotomy greatly influences the image of women in society. Unbeknownst to many, stigma arises among women themselves. Hence, the term 'good women' emerges according to patriarchal cultural standard (Rutter & Barr, 2021). This phenomenon is encapsulated in the following quote:

تقف مع الشاب والناس تخمس وتستت، ومن يقول كلمة تصبح ثاني يوم
كلام. البنت وفي التسعة عشرة وتقول إنها لا تفكر في الزواج! في سنّها كان
ورائي ولد وبنت وحبل في الثالث.

Taqīfu ma'a al-shābi wa al-nāsu tukhamissu wa tusattitu, wa man yaqūlu kalimatan tuṣbiḥu thānī yawmin kalāmūn. al-Bintu wa fī al-tis'ati 'ashrah wa taqūlu innahā lā tufakkiru fī al-zuwāji! Fī sinnihā warāi waladun wa bintun wa ḥablī fī al-thālithi ('Āsyūr, 2010).

She was with a young man. And people judged her. Someone said something, and the next day, rumors spread. The girl is nineteen years old and says she doesn't think about marriage! At her age, I already have a daughter and a son, and I'm pregnant with the third child.

The sentences above are excerpts from a woman's speech in the Shatila refugee camp. She seems to be judging other women who are not like her. In the patriarchal perspective, a good woman is one who is bound in marriage. After that, all household responsibilities are imposed upon her. This argument is further reinforced by the following data:

يا أمي... ذهبنا إلى الطبيب. عندي مشكلة. وكثر خيرها أنها ستبقى معي رغم أنني غير قادر على منحها أطفالاً.

وما إن سمعت خالتي هذا الكلام حتى زادت هما وغما وقالت:
هذا الكلام لا يصدق وغير معقول، ولم يحدث لأي من رجال العائلة.
يا أمي، ذهبنا إلى الطبيب وأكد أن المشكلة عندي.
اذهب لحكيم غيره. أكد أن الحكيم الذي استشرته من جماعتها واتفقوا معه على قول هذا الكلام
استدركت:

ولماذا تذهب؟ سأبحث لك عن عروس فتعرف بعد شهر أو شهرين أنك
بخير. تحبل امرأتك وبعد تسعة شهور يأتي الولد.

لاولد ولا تلد

Yā ummī... dhahabnā ilā al-ṭabībī. 'Indī mushkilah. Wa kathura khayruhā annahā satabqā ma'ī raghma annānī ghairu qādirin 'alā manḥihā aṭfālun.

Wa mā in sami'at khālatī hadhā al-kalāma ḥattā zādat humā wa qālat:

Hadhā al-kalāmu lā yuṣaddiqu wa ghairu ma'qūlin, wa lam yaḥduth liyyin min rijālī al-'āilati.

Yā ummī, dhahabnā ilā al-ṭabībī wa akadda anna al- mushkilata 'indī.

Idhab liḥakīmin ghayrihi. Akada anna al-ḥakīma alladhī ishtarathu min jamā'atihā wa ittafaqu ma'ahu 'alā qauli hadhā al-kalāmi.

Istadrakat:

Wa limādhā tadhhabu? Sa'abḥathu laka 'an 'arūsin fata'rifu ba'da shahrin aw shahrayni annaka bikhayrin. Tuḥabbalu imra'ataka wa ba'da tis'ati shuhūrin ya'tī al-waladu.

La Walada wa la talida ('Āsyūr, 2010).

Mother... we went to the doctor. I have a problem. There is some good news, she will still stay with me even though I am unable to give her a child.

When my aunty heard it, her anxiety increased, and she said:

These words have no trust and are unreasonable. This has never happened to a man in our family.

Mother, we have been to the doctor. He confirmed that the problem lies with me.

Go to another another experts. Surely, the doctor belongs to her community. They made an agreement with him to say these words.

Suddenly she changed her mind:

Why did you go? I will find you a bride, and after a month or two, you will see that everything is fine. Your wife will become pregnant and nine months later, you will have a son....

No son, no childbirth.

The marriage couple without children tends to be looked down upon, diminished, and considered a failed family. Therefore, the stigma received affects the interaction between husband and wife (Iskandar et al., 2019). The quote from the novel above indicates the presence of stigma that a childless family is not a perfect family. Furthermore, within the confines of patriarchal culture, the label of barrenness is often pinned on women. This is because of the societal paradigm that women bear and give birth after marriage. It is unfortunate that this negative stigma comes from fellow

women. Often, women judge other women who do not share the same experience. This further marginalizes women. Thus, in the typical Levantine expression, the term *La Walada wa la talida*, meaning “no son, no childbirth”. This signifies that a family will be considered lacking without the presence of a son. Sons are deemed more prestigious than daughters.

Resistance of Palestinian Women in *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah*

For decades, the Palestinian people have engaged in various tactics and approaches to resist dispossession, displacement, and occupation (Ryan, 2015). Unfortunately, the portrait of Palestinian women's resistance often gets lost in historical records. Through this novel, the novelist brings it back into focus. Consider the following data:

تكاد مضافة البلد لا تخلو من لقاءات الرجال، يطيلون السهر فيها إلى
ساعات متأخرة من الليل. وأحيانا يوقظنا أبي من النوم ليطلب إعداد
لقمة وفراش للضيوف

Takādu maḍāfati al-baladi lā takhlū min liqā'ati al-rijālī, yuṭlūna al-sahra fihā ilā
sā'atin mut'āakhiratin min al-layli. Wa aḥyānan yūqizunā abī min al-nawmi liyaṭluba
i'dāda luqmatin wa firāshin lilḍuyūfi (‘Āsyūr, 2010).

The community center is almost always bustling with gatherings of men, who extend their stay into the late hours of the night. Sometimes, my father wakes us from our sleep to request the preparation of refreshments and mattresses for the guests.

Cooking and preparing household necessities are activities typically assigned to women. At first glance, there appears to be no resistance by Palestinian women. This is because war is often associated with masculine traits. However, without accommodations such as food and care for wounded soldiers, the war would not be able to proceed. The above quote demonstrates how women are present in the resistance through providing accommodations for the men guarding their villages from the Israeli forces that began occupying several Palestinian villages in 1948. The men stand guard and discuss strategies to protect the village, while the women prepare the accommodations. From this, it is evident that both men and women have their respective roles in the mission against the Israeli army. There is no dominance between the two sides.

Women are considered to have more detailed memories than men. According to the following quote, Palestinian women use this advantage as a form of resistance:

قبل عشرين عاما اتصلت بي الست بيان نوميض زوجة شفيق الحوت مدير
مكتب المنظمة في لبنان. قالت لي إنها تجمع شهادات الناجين من المجزرة،
أهالي شاتيلا وصبرا والأحياء المتخمة. أرادت أن أجمعها بما أعرف منهم.
ففعلته. استمعت الست بيان إلى هنية هنا في البيت.... وبعد عشرين عاما
اتصلت بي الست بيان وقالت لي إنها انتهت من الكتاب وأنه صدر.

Qabla 'ishrūna 'āman ittaṣalat bī al-sitt Bayān Nuwayhid zawjatu Shafīq al-Hūt mudīru maktabi al-munaḍḍamati fī Lubnān. Qālat lī innahā tajma'u shahādati al-najīna min almuḥzarati, ahālī Shātīlā wa Ṣabran wa al-aḥyā'i al-mutakhimati. Arādat an ajma'uḥā bimā a'rifu minhum. Fafa'altuhu. Istama'at al-sitt Bayān ilā Haniyyah hunā fī al-bayti.... Wa ba'da 'ishrūna 'āman ittaṣalat bī al-sitt Bayān wa qālat lī innahā intahat min al-kitābi wa innahu ṣadara ('Āsyūr, 2010).

Twenty years ago, Mrs. Bayan Nuwayhid, the wife of Syafiq al-Hout, a director of an organization in Lebanon, contacted me. She told me that she was gathering testimonies from survivors of the massacres, the people of Shatila, Sabra, and their surrounding neighbors. She wanted me to collect testimonies from people I knew. I did so. Mrs. Bayan listened to Haniyyah's testimony here, in this house.... Twenty years later, Mrs. Bayan contacted me and informed me that she had completed her book and it had been published.

Bayan Nuwayhid is a female historian and journalist who was born and raised in al-Quds before the 1948 Nakba events took place. She documented her own along with other Palestinian's memories of the Sabra and Shatilla massacres. While she lacked men's physical strength, she fought back through writing. Writing is regarded as a more effective means of communication than violence. It possesses the ability to exert greater influence. Bayan Nuwayhid, as a representative of Palestinian women, uses writing to resist the Israeli occupation. The resistance of Palestinian women in this novel is also portrayed through the character Wisal, as the following quote shows:

هذا نو إسرائيل. هذا ثوب فلسطيني طرزته بيدي.... إسرائيل سارقة. سرقت أرضنا وشردتنا وذبحتنا. وحتى الثوب الذي أرتديه تطمع فيه! هذا التطريز سهرت عليه الليالي. اسمه ((فلاحي)). هذا ثوب فلسطيني فلاحي.... ذس وذس وذس كله فلسطين. تعرف تل أبيب؟ تل أبيب ذات نفسها مسروقة. سرقوا يافا وسموها تل أبيب.

Hadhā nū Izrā'īl. Hadhā thawbun Filasṭīniyyun tarraztuhu biyadi.... Izrā'īl sarāqah. Saraat arḍanā wa sharadatnā wa dhabahnā. Wa ḥattā al-thawbu alladhī artadīhi taṭma'u fīhi! Hadhā al-taṭrīzu saharat 'alayhi al-layālī. Ismuhu ((filāhiyyun)). Hadhā thawbun Filasṭīniyyun filāhiyyun.... Dhis wa dhis wa dhis kulluhu Filasṭīn. Ta'rifu Tal Abīb? Tal Abīb dhāta nafsihā masrūqatun. Saraqū Yāfā sammūhā Tal Abīb ('Āsyūr, 2010).

This no Israel. This is a traditional Palestinian attire that I embroidered with my own hand.... Israel is a thief. It steals our land, displaces us, and slaughters us. And now it even wants the clothes I wear! This embroidery keeps me awake all night. Its name is (Fellahiy). This is a Palestinian Fellahiy attire.... This, this, this all Palestine. Do you know Tel Aviv? Tel Aviv itself is stolen. They stole Yafa and named it Tel Aviv.

The above sentences are excerpts from the experience of the character Wisal. One day, she was strolling on a beach in Greece. Suddenly, a stranger remarked that Wisal must be from Israel based on her attire. Loudly, she explained that the clothing she wore was traditional Palestinian attire. She also stated that Israel is a thief, stealing everything belonging to Palestine, including the traditional clothing she wore.

Israel not only seizes Palestinian land but also appropriates their culture. As a result, Wisal's actions constitute resistance to the Israeli occupation. Wisal is able to assert Palestine's existence in the face of Israeli colonization, although in indirect ways.

This phenomenon dispels the myth that women are timid and lack the opportunity to speak publicly. Palestinian women can also resist in their own ways.

The resistance of Palestinian women does not stop at that stage. They also participate in taking to the streets and demonstrating. They face Israeli soldiers bravely. Consider the following quote:

المظاهرات. الاعتصامات. العمليات المسلحة. مواجهة الاحتلال وجها لوجه
بين العسكر المدرعين بالسلاح ورجال البيوت في القرية أو رجالها أو
مسجدها أو تلاميذها.

al-Muzāharātu. al-I'tisāmu. al-‘Amaliyyātu al-musallahātu. Muwājahatu al-iḥtilālī wajhan liwajhin bayna al-‘askari al-mudarra’īna bi al-silāḥi wa rabābi al-buyūti fī al-qaryati aw rijālīhā aw masjidīhā aw talāmīdhīhā (‘Āsyūr, 2010).

Demonstrations. Sit-ins. Armed operations. Confrontations between armed forces and housewives in villages, their men, their mosques, and their students.

During the Israeli occupation, all layers of Palestinian society engaged in resistance, including its women. As the quote above illustrates, bravely, mothers participated in combat against armed forces. In terms of strength, they might not be comparable, but their spirit to defend their homeland's existence is remarkable. Women's demonstrations also occurred in Palestinian refugee camps in Lebanon. Consider the following quote:

أتردد على المخيم. أشد أزر أم فلان أو جارة من جارتها لأن ابنها اختفي أو
اعتقل الجيش زوجها. أقرأ جريدة السفير على ختيارات أميات. أساعد في
إعداد قوائم المخطوفين. أشارك في مسيرة نسائية صغير الحجم (مضى
عهد المظاهرات الكبيرة). ينظمها اتحاد المرأة لأهالي المخطوفين.

Ataraddadu ‘alā al-mukhayyami. Ashuddu azur umma fulān aw jāratan min jāratihā lianna ibnuhā ikhtafā aw i’taqala al-jayshu zawjahā. Aqra’u jarīdata al-Safir ‘alā khityarāti umyāti. Usā’idu fī i’dādi qawā’imi al-makhtūfīna. Usyāriku fī masūratin nisā’iyyatin ṣaghīru al-ḥajmi (maḍā ‘ahdu al-muḍāhirāti al-kabīrati), yunazzimuhā ittiḥādu al-mar’ati liahlī al-makhtūfīna (‘Āsyūr, 2010).

I visited the refugee camp several times. I insisted on visiting Mrs. Fulan or one of her neighbors because her child had gone missing or soldiers had captured her husband. I read the Al-Safir newspaper to illiterate elders. I helped prepare lists of abducted individuals. I participated in small women's parades organized by the women's union for families of the abducted.

In patriarchal society, the image of women is often associated with envy and unwillingness to concede to other women. However, the quote above demonstrates solidarity among Palestinian women in refugee camps. They support each other and resist, even with steps that may be considered simple. This is what the novelist aims to convey, so that the world sees that women are not always marked negatively.

The resistance of Palestinian women is also evident in the *Intifada* events. The *Intifada* itself is a civil resistance of the Palestinian people to reclaim their homeland. They resist with whatever weapons they have, knowing they are outmatched with the

arms of their adversaries. However, their spirit continues to burn. This phenomenon is evident from the following quotes:

Quote I

أدقق في الصور كلما أظهرت امرأة في ثوب فلاحي مطرز ترفع يدها بعزم
لتلقي حجرا على سيارة من سيارات الجيش أو تشتبك مع المجندين لتخلص
منهم طفلا أمسكوا به.

Udaqququ fī al-ṣuwari kullamā azharat imra'atun fī ṣawbin filāhiyyin muārrazin tarfa'u yadahā bi'azmin litalqiya ḥajaran 'alā sayyāratin min al-sayyārati al-jayshi aw tashtabiku ma'a al-munjadīna litakhalluṣi minhum ṭiflan amsakū bihi ('Āsyūr, 2010).

I observed those images every time I saw a woman in embroidered fellahiy dress raising her hand with determination to throw a stone at one of the military vehicles or fighting to free a child they had captured.

Quote II

... وهي تحكي عن الإنتفاضة وأولادها.
جاءوا لاعتقالي. قلت ماشي لكن لن أركب سيارة إسرائيلية. صاحوا في
فصحت فيهم.... قلت ممكن في تاكسي. ضحكوا وقالوا: مرة مجنون! وأنا
قلت لا مجنون ولا عاقل. لن أركب سيارة إسرائيلية تحملي في شوارع
جنين.... كررت: لن أركب في سيارة إسرائيلية إلا لو قيدتموني وحملتوني
حملا. ستربك أني طويلة ووزني ثقيل، ثلاثة منهم لا يقدرّون على حملي.
ركبت رأسي. قالوا إذن تمشي. قطعت الطريق من المخيم للمخفر وأنا أمشي
بهدوء، رأسي مرفوعة كأني ملكة. وهم يحرسونني من الجانبين والسيارة
العسكرية تسير ورائي ببطء.

... Wa hiyā tuḥkī 'an al-intifādati wa awlādiḥā.
Jā'u lī 'atiqālī. Qultu māshī lakin lan arkaḥ sayyāratan Isrā'iliyyatan. Ṣāhū fiyī fasaḥtu fīhim.... Qultu mumkin fī tāksī. Ḍaḥakū wa qālū: marah majnūn! Wa anā qultu lā majnūn w lā 'āqilun. Lan arkaḥ sayyāratan Isrā'iliyyatan taḥmilunī fī shawārī 'I Janīn.... Karrartu: lan arkaḥ fī sayyāratan Isrā'iliyyatan illā law qayadtumūnī wa ḥamalātunī ḥamlan. Satara rabbuka innī ṭawīlah wa waznī thaḳīl, thalāthatun minhum lā yuqaddirūna 'alā ḥamlī. Rakibtu ra'sī. Qalū iẓan tamshī. Qaṭa'tu al-ṭarīqa min al-mukhayyami lilmakhfari wa anā amshī bihudū'in, ra'sī marfū'atun kaannanī malikatan. Wa hum yaḥrisūnanī min al-jānibayni wa al-sayyāratu al-'askariyyatu taṣīru warāi bibuṭ'in ('Āsyūr, 2010).

... She (Wisal) tells about the Intifada and her children.

They (the Israeli soldiers) came to arrest me. I said, fine but I don't want to ride in an Israeli car. They shouted at me and I shouted at them.... I said, maybe in a taxi. They laughed and said: crazy woman! I said, crazy or not, I would never get in the Israeli car that took me on the streets of Jenin.... I repeat: I will never get into an Israeli car unless you tie me up and carry me. Your Lord hid my height and weight, three of them were not strong enough to carry me. I shook my head. They said, 'Then go!'. I

cut the road from the refugee camp to the guard post. I walked calmly. My head is lifted like a queen. Soldiers guarded me on two sides. Israeli military vehicles were moving very slowly behind me.

Quote III

ومرة كانت ليلة عيد وطلع شباب المخيم على أسلاك الكهرباء وعلقوا الأعلام. أصبح العيد، والمخيم مرفرفة عليه أعلام فلسطين كأنه عيد تحرير مش عيد ربنا. ركبهم العفاريت. دخلوا المخيم وشتائم وبذاءات. ((نزلوا الأعلام)). الشباب كأنه ملح وذاب. قالت نساء المخيم لا نستطيع أن نصعد، اصعدوا أنتم. وقفنا نتفرج عليهم هم يصعدون وينزلون الأعلام....

Wa marratan kānat laylatu ‘īd wa ṭala’a syabābu al-mukhayyami ‘alā aslāki al-kahrubāi wa ‘allaqū al-a’lāma. Aṣḥaḥa al-‘īdu, wa al-mukhayyamu murafrāfatun ‘alayhi a’lāmun Filasṭiniyyun kaannahu ‘īdu taḥrīrin mush ‘īd rabbīnā. Rakibathum al-‘āfarīt. Dakhalū al-mukhayyama wa shatāima wa bizaāti. (Nazzalū al-a’lāma). Al-shabābu kaannahu milhun waḥabun. Qālat nisāu al-mukhayyami lā nastaṭī’u an naṣ’uda, uṣ’udū antum. Waqafnā natafaraju ‘alayhim hum yaṣ’udūna wa yunazzilūnā al-a’lāma... (‘Āsyūr, 2010).

One night, on the holiday eve, the young men lit decorative lights and hoisted flags. The holiday felt more like Palestine’s Independence Day than a celebration of our God. It was as if the spirits of the Ifrit jinn possessed them. They entered the refugee camp with insults and curses, demanding, “Take down the flag!” The young men turned into melting salt. The women said, “We can’t climb. You climb!” We stood watching them raise and lower the flag....

These quotes depict nonviolent resistance by Palestinian women. The First quote indicates the presence of women in acts of resistance against Israeli soldiers. Moreover, Palestinian women engage in their actions while wearing traditional attire. This shows that Palestinian women also seek to assert the identity and existence of the Palestinian people. At this level, women’s fondness for adornment is no longer viewed negatively, but rather the opposite. By adorning themselves in traditional clothing, they make an effort to preserve their identity. It is undeniable that culture is the identity of a nation. If a culture disappears, the existence of that nation will also diminish.

Throughout history, women have been narrated as the condemned and blamed by stereotypes. Women are punished as weak, obedient creatures, always victimized. However, on the other hand, they are blamed as evil figures like monsters. Through the second and the third quote, ‘Āṣūr presents that labeling women as monsters is not always negative. Traits like stubbornness, courage, outspokenness, recklessness, and anger are used to resist Israel. Therefore, it is not uncommon for verbal confrontations to occur between Palestinian housewives and Israeli security forces.

It turns out that Palestinian women's resistance is not limited to spontaneous and nonviolent action. Some also join military and political organizations. This is evident in the following quote:

تشكوا من ابنتها الصغرى العنيدة التي تصر على مواصلة تعلمها والعمل مع الفدائية

بس البنات تطلع من الصبح ولا ترجع إلا المساء، وتقول باتدرب على السلاح؟!

Tashkū min ibnatihā al-ṣuḡhrā al-‘anīdati allatī taṣṣiru ‘alā muwāṣalati ta’allumihā wa al-‘amali ma’a al-fidāiyyati bas al-bintu taṭla’u min al-ṣubḥi wa lā tarji’u illā al-masā, wa taqūlu bitadarrubi ‘alā al-silāhi?! (‘Āsyūr, 2010).

She complained about her youngest daughter's steadfast determination to study and work with the resistance movement. The daughter would leave early in the morning and not return until the nighttime. She frequently mentioned that she was training with weapons.

Fidāiyyah is a Palestinian guerrilla or militant movement with a leftist nationalist orientation. The movement originated from Palestinian civilians who fled or were displaced from their homes following the 1948 Arab-Israeli war. Along its journey, this movement, comprised of various factions, was unified under the Palestinian Liberation Organization (PLO). Palestinian women also joined through several women's movement organizations. However, this fact often goes unnoticed in historical records (Holt, 2005). The quote above captures the fact that Palestinian women also took up arms to fight against Israeli colonization. They were involved in military training. It can be concluded that they possess bravery and resilience. This phenomenon reaffirms the presence of masculine traits in women, which are often overlooked due to patriarchal societal constructs. This is reinforced by the following quote:

توجهت مع عدد من زملائي إلى مكتب الجبهة الشعبية وهناك انضم إلينا
مجموعة من الشباب وفتاتان، أذكر أن واحدة منهما كانت من فتح. قررنا
أن نناوش الجنود الإسرائيليين على طريقة إضرب واهرب. ... وهناك أيضا
فتاة اسمها فاطمة من فتح

Tawajjahtu ma’a ‘adadin min zumalā’ī ilā maktabi al-jihhati al-sha’biyyati wa hunāka inḍama ilaynā majmu’atun min al-shabābi wa fatātāni, uẓakkiru anna wāḥidatan minhumā kānat min Fatah. Qarrarnā an nunāwisha al-junūda al-Isrāīliyyīna ‘alā ṭarīqati iḍrab wa ihrāb. ... wa hunāka ayḍan fatātun ismuhā Fāṭimah min Fatah (‘Āsyūr, 2010).

I went with a group of comrades to the headquarters of the Palestinian people's movement, where several young men and two girls joined us. I remember one of the girls was from Fatah. We decided to confront the Israeli army with hit-and-run tactics. There was also a girl from Fatah, her name is Fatimah.

Fatah is one of the largest factions within the PLO. One of its supporting organizations is the Women's Committee for Social Work (WCSW). Therefore, there is no doubt that women are involved in this movement. Women and men work together to fight against the Israeli forces. Women have equal space and opportunity to discuss attack tactics. They also join the fight against Israeli forces alongside other fighters with enthusiasm and courage. This fact demonstrates that women also possess masculine traits often attributed to men. It also proves that Palestinian women are engaged in resistance against Israeli occupation.

CONCLUSIONS

In various narratives of the Palestinian conflict, the role of women is often overlooked. This is because conflict and warfare are always considered male domains. War is always associated with masculinity. It is associated with strong, agile men skilled in using various types of weapons. Literary works, as a symbolic communication, play an important role in expressing the existence of women, especially in the context of the Palestinian conflict

This research aims to answer question regarding the position and role of Palestinian women amidst the conflict engulfing their homeland through the novel titled *al-Ṭanṭūriyyah*. Based on the research, it can be concluded that Palestinian women also resist Israeli occupation. Their resistance consists of both nonviolent and violent forms. Nonviolent resistance is conducted through demonstrations and protests while wearing typical Palestinian women's attire. They do this to preserve their existence as Palestinians. They also resist by assisting in providing accommodations and writing testimonies of themselves and survivors of massacres committed by Israel. They also engage in resistance through military and political channels. Alongside male fighters, they support each other in fighting against the Israeli army. If men resist with violence, women are capable of resisting with both violence and nonviolence. It, of course, does not negate the femininity inherent within them.

Indeed, women are often "sentenced" as weak, obedient, emotional, nagging, angry, sexy, seductive, and other perceived negative characteristics. Women receive little attention in many significant global events. Consequently, the presence of women must continue to be recognized. A possibility to accomplish this is to conduct research on novels that portray women's experiences.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

REFERENCES

- ‘Āsyūr, R. (2010). *ath-Thanthūriyyah* (I). al-Qahirah: Dar asy-Syuruq.
- Ahmadi, A. (2019). *Metodologi Penelitian Sastra Perspektif Monodisipliner dan Interdisipliner* (Cetakan Pe; N. R. Hariyati, Ed.). Gresik: Graniti.
- Amer, M. W. (2023). Hamas in Cyberspace: Social Media and Forms of Political Expression. *Arab Media and Society*, 2023(35), 85–114.
- Basyuni, M. M. (2015). Ideologi HAMAS gerakan Perlawanan Islam. *Jurnal CMES*, VIII(1), 103.
- Bustam, B. M. R. (2014). Tantoura: Antara Indahnya Pantai dan Kelamnya Sejarah (Analisis Ekokritik). Retrieved April 26, 2022, from <http://www.jurnal.uinbanten.ac.id/index.php/alfaz/article/view/611/531>
- Cixous, H. (1976). The Laugh of the Medusa. *Signs*, 1(4), 875–893. <https://doi.org/10.36019/9780813568409-027>
- Cockburn, C. (2014). War and security, women and gender: An overview of the issues. *Gender and Development*, 21(3), 433–452.



<https://doi.org/10.1080/13552074.2013.846632>

Cowper-Coles, M. (2022). *Gender and Political Support: Women and Hamas in the Occupied Palestinian Territories*. Routledge.
<https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003177395>

El-Mansi, Z. (2021). Blurring the Boundaries between History and Fiction in Khoury's Gate of the Sun and Ashour's The Woman from Tantoura. *Cairo Studies in English*, 2021(1). <https://doi.org/10.21608/cse.2021.205017>

El Saadawi, N. (2015). *The Hidden Face of Eve* (third Edit; S. Hetata, Ed.). London: Zed Books. <https://doi.org/10.5040/9781350251076>

Habibullah, M., & Rahmah, U. S. (2023). The Patriarchal Power for Traditional Chinese Women in Pearl S. Buck's "The Good Earth." *OKARA: Jurnal Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 17(1), 134–152. <https://doi.org/10.19105/ojbs.v17i1.8575>

Halizza, Bella Cintya Nur, Suryani, S. (2022). *Changing The Largest Forces of Inequality by Ruqayya in Radwa Ashour 's The Woman From Tantoura*. 16(2), 98–108. <https://doi.org/10.21107/prosodi.v16i2.13116>

Handayani, V. (2023). Subaltern Perempuan dalam Perang pada Cerpen " Sang Guru Juki ." *Sirok Bastra*, 11(2), 189–198.

Herlina, E., Iman, D. T., & Maizufri, M. (2022). Pendobrakan Marjinalisasi Perempuan pada Drama Korea Because This is My First Life (Perspektif Binar Patriarki Helene Cixous). *Anthropos: Jurnal Antropologi Sosial Dan Budaya (Journal of Social and Cultural Anthropology)*, 8(1), 43–58.

Holt, M. (2005). Palestinian Women and the Intifada. In H. Afshar (Ed.), *Women and Politics in the Third World* (Online Edition, pp. 189–206). London: Routledge.

Iskandar, A. M., Kasim, H., & Halim, H. (2019). The Childless Couple Efforts to Harmonize Their Marital Relationships. *Society*, 7(2), 135–149. <https://doi.org/10.33019/society.v7i2.100>

Jad, I. (2018). *Palestinian Women's Activism: Nationalism, Secularism, Islamism* (First Edit). New York: Syracuse University Press.
<https://doi.org/10.1525/jps.2019.48.3.107>

Jamal, A. M. (2020). A Village Rises in the First Intifada: International Women's Day, March 8, 1988. In M. M. Stephan, Rita & Charrad (Ed.), *Women Rising* (pp. 245–258). New York: New York University Press.

Lasut, Yovanka Ayunita Deborah, Rosyidin, Muhammad & Hanura, M. (2022). Perspektif Feminisme Standpoint pada Perjuangan Perempuan Palestina terhadap sikap Diskriminatif Tentara Israel dalam Konflik Israel - Palestina. *Journal International Relations*, 8(No 4), 690–704. Retrieved from



<https://medium.com/@arifwicaksanaa/pengertian-use-case-a7e576e1b6bf>

- Mawaddah, H., Suyitno, S., & Suhita, R. (2021). Javanese Women's Efforts to Face Patriarchal Culture in the Novel *Para Priyayi* by Umar Kayam. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 8(1), 100. <https://doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v8i1.2267>
- Nashef, H. A. M. (2021). Suppressed Nakba Memories in Palestinian female narratives: Susan Abulhawa's *The Blue Between Sky and Water* and Radwa Ashour's *The Woman from Tantoura*. *Interventions International Journal of Postcolonial Studies*, 0(0), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1369801X.2021.1892513>
- Rutter, N., & Barr, U. (2021). Being a 'good woman': Stigma, relationships and desistance. *Probation Journal*, 68(2), 166–185. <https://doi.org/10.1177/02645505211010336>
- Ryan, C. (2015). Everyday Resilience as Resistance: Palestinian Women Practicing Sumud. *International Political Sociology*, 9(4), 299–315. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ips.12099>
- Semi, M. A. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Sastra* (Edisi Digi; Tim Penyunting Angkasa, Ed.). Bandung: Penerbit Angkasa Bandung.
- Taheri, A. F., Zohrabi, M., Zohrabi, M., & Kouhanestani, M. S. *Thinking the Unthinkable: Hélène Cixous and the feminine marginality*. 181–195. <https://doi.org/10.22034/jpiut.2019.29505.2114>
- Utami, S. F. (2022). TRANSMISI MEMORI TRAUMATIS DALAM NOVEL ATH-THANTŪRIYYAH KARYA RADHWĀ 'ĀSYŪR. *Diwan: Jurnal Bahasa Dan Sastra Arab*, 14(2), 63–76. <https://doi.org/10.15548/diwan.v14i2.827>
- Utami, S. F. (2023). Challenging Cultural Appropriation: Palestinian Cultural Identity in Radhwā 'Āsyūr's Novel *Ath-Thanthūriyyah*. *Leksema: Jurnal Bahasa Dan Sastra*, 8(2), 119–132. <https://doi.org/10.22515/ljbs.v8i2.6287>
- Veronese, G., Cavazzoni, F., Russo, S., & Sousa, C. (2019). Risk and Protective Factors Among Palestinian Women Living in a Context of Prolonged Armed Conflict and Political Oppression. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 36(19–20), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260519865960>
- Zanotti, J., & Sharp, J. M. (2023). Israel and Hamas 2023 Conflict In Brief: Overview, U.S. Policy, and Options for Congress. *Congressional Research Service*, R47828.
- Zeitsoff, T. (2018). Does Social Media Influence Conflict? Evidence from the 2012 Gaza Conflict. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, 62(1), 29–63. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022002716650925>